

December 23, 2015

#### Via Hand Delivery

Ms. Lora W. Johnson, CMC Clerk of Council Room 1E09, City Hall 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112

Re: BSI Motion regarding Council Docket No: UD-08-02, Integrated Resource Planning

Dear Ms. Johnson:

Enclosed please find an original and three copies of an Opposition of the Alliance for Affordable Energy to the Motion by Building Science Innovators, LLC. Please file the attached Opposition and this letter in the record of the proceeding in accordance with normal procedure.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Sincerely,

Casey DeMoss

Alliance for Affordable Energy

Cc: Official Service List

# BEFORE THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

IN RE: RESOLUTION REGARDING	)	
PROPOSED RULEMAKING TO	)	
ESTABLISH INTEGRATED	)	
RESOURCE PLANNING	) DOCKET NO UD-(	<b>)8-02</b>
COMPONENTS AND REPORTING	)	
REQUIREMENTS FOR ENTERGY	)	
NEW ORLEANS, INC.	)	

# OPPOSITION OF THE ALLIANCE FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY TO THE MOTION BY BUILDING SCIENCE INNOVATORS, LLC

The Alliance for Affordable Energy (hereinafter "the Alliance") is deeply concerned about the motion filed by Building Science Innovators, LLC (hereinafter "BSI") and regrets that BSI acted unilaterally without concern for the process or other parties. The Alliance is alarmed by BSI's proposals as set forth in its motion.

The first proposal is to delay the IRP filing by 6 months. Delaying the IRP filing will not solve BSI's concerns. The delay will jeopardize Energy Smart's funding for year 2017. While the Alliance shares BSI's concern that ENO will fail to file an IRP appropriate to New Orleans we differ markedly on the efforts being made by Council. The Alliance is confident that ENO will take direction from their regulators regarding the final IRP, and it is our understanding that every effort is being made by Council members, CURO office staff and council advisors to ensure that ENO understands the intent and requirements for the 2015 IRP. ENO filed an Action Plan on December 15<sup>th</sup> and the Alliance is currently reviewing it and will provide feedback to the parties if we deem it necessary.

The Alliance is disheartened by the tone of BSI's motion. It appears to the Alliance that the only solution that would be acceptable to BSI would be an IRP that justifies a large deployment of batteries and solar pv supplied by BSI to replace all other generation resources. The Alliance is interested in batteries but we need to see this technology proven on a commercial scale before recommending the use of ratepayer dollars on the idea. To be very clear, there is no way that the Alliance would support utility scale deployment of a technology that is great in theory. It must be demonstrably great. Ratepayer dollars are too valuable and the Council and ENO have a duty to manage those dollars responsibly. For this very reason, the IRP process was created. ENO is studying batteries with solar on a small utility scale (1 MW). The Alliance believes it would be appropriate to study battery and pv use on the residential side as a small pilot program. In addition, it may be useful to add a battery component to the demand response programs as a trial. This pilot could be developed through the Energy Smart implementation planning process for years 2017 and 2018.

BSI's complaints about Energy Smart are inappropriate for the IRP and totally ignore the significant praise that the program has garnered. These comments should have been directed to the Request for Proposals for the Third Party Administrator intervenor comment process.

Feedback regarding the Energy Smart program and its effectiveness is welcome, that said, filing a vitriolic motion in the IRP docket is not the best way to provide this feedback.

The Alliance believes that BSI has made some compelling points about enhancing the definition of DSM to include solar/batteries and encourages the Council to modify the definition of DSM for the 2018 IRP. This would allow ENO to study the effect of solar and batteries as a DSM measure and compare its performance against other DSM measures.

The Alliance believes that BSI has a fundamental misunderstanding of rate-making. Changes in rates for residential customers are set during rate cases. The Alliance supports looking at time of use rates and this pricing will soon be possible as Entergy companies move to smarter meters. The Alliance recommends considering dynamic pricing during the upcoming rate case in 2018. The Alliance believes that the Customer Lowered Electricity Price proposal is more appropriate under the Net-metering docket as a place to study alternatives to solar net-metering.

Finally, the Alliance is encouraged by the Council's resolution to grow energy efficiency and setting targets for this purpose. The Council has received high praise from the Natural Resource Defense Council and the American Council for an Energy Efficient Economy, two very prominent organizations with expertise in the topic.

The Alliance encourages the Council to reject all five proposals made by BSI at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

Casey Le Moss

Casey DeMoss

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this 23<sup>rd</sup> day of December, 2015, served the required number of Copies of the foregoing pleading upon all other known parties, of this proceeding, as listed below, by electronic mail.

Respectfully submitted,

Casey ha Mors

Casey DeMoss

Alliance for Affordable Energy 4035 Washington Ave

New Orleans, LA 70125

Lora W. Johnson,

lwjohnson@nola.gov

Clerk of Council

City Hall - Room 1E09

1300 Perdido Street

New Orleans, LA 70112

(504) 658-1085 - office

(504) 658-1140 - fax

Service of Discovery not required

#### **Perlina Thomas**

pthomas@nola.gov

Director, City Council Utilities Regulatory Office City Hall - Room 6E07 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112 (504) 658-1110 - office (504) 658-1117 - fax Evelyn F. Pugh, efpugh@nola.gov

Interim Chief of Staff
New Orleans City Council
City Hall - Room 1E06
1300 Perdido Street
New Orleans, LA 70112
(504) 658-1080 - office
(504) 658-1100 - fax

### Sharonda Williams,

shrwilliams@nola.gov

City Attorney

Law Department

City Hall - 5th Floor

New Orleans, LA 70112

(504) 658-9800 - office

(504) 658-9869 - fax

Service of Discovery not required

#### DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE

#### Norman S. Foster,

nsfoster@nola.gov Department of Finance City Hall - Room 3W06 1300 Perdido Street New Orleans, LA 70112 (504) 658-1519- office (504) 658-1705 - fax

# ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING OFFICER

Hon. Jeffrey S. Gulin, jgulin@verizon.net 3203 Bridle Ridge Lane Lutherville, MD 21093 (410) 627-5357

# NEW ORLEANS CITY COUNCIL CONSULTANTS

Clinton A. Vince, Esq., clinton.vince@dentons.com
Presley Reed, Esq., presley.reedjr@dentons.com
Emma F. Hand, Esq., emma.hand@dentons.com
DENTONS US LLP
1301 K Street NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 408-6400 - office
(202) 408-6399 - fax

Basile J. Uddo, Esq. 504-583-8604 cell, buddo@earthlink.net
J. A. "Jay" Beatmann, Jr., Esq. (504) 858-9885 cell,
jay.beatmann@dentons.com
c/o DENTONS US LLP
650 Poydras Street
Suite 2850
New Orleans, LA 70130

Walter J. Wilkerson, Esq.,
wwilkerson@wilkersonplc.com
Bobbie Mason, Esq.,
bmason@wilkersonplc.com
Kelley Bazile,
kbazile@wilkersonplc.com
Wilkerson and Associates, PLC
650 Poydras Street - Suite 1913
New Orleans, LA 70130
(504) 522-4572 - office
(504) 522-0728 - fax

#### Joseph Vumbaco,

jvumbaco@ergconsulting.com Legend Consulting Group 8055 East Tufts Ave., Suite 1250 Denver, CO 80237-2835 (303) 843-0351 - office (303) 843-0529 - fax

Errol Smith, ersmith@btcpas.com
Bruno and Tervalon
4298 Elysian Fields Avenue
New Orleans, LA 70122
(504) 284-8733 - office
(504) 284-8296 - fax

### ENTERGY NEW ORLEANS, INC. and ENTERGY LOUISISANA, LLC – ALGIERS

#### Gary E. Huntley,

ghuntle@entergy.com
Entergy New Orleans, Inc.
Vice-President, Regulatory Affairs
1600 Perdido Street, L-MAG 505B
New Orleans, LA 70112
504-670-3680 office
504-670-3615 fax

#### Seth Cureington,

scurein@entergy.com

Entergy New Orleans, Inc. Manager, Resource Planning 1600 Perdido Street, L-MAG 505B New Orleans, LA 70112 504-670-3602 office 504-670-3615 fax

#### Polly S. Rosemond,

prosemo@entergy.com

Entergy New Orleans, Inc. Manager, Regulatory Affairs 1600 Perdido Street, L-MAG 505B New Orleans, LA 70112 504-670-3567 office 504-670-3615 fax

### Kathryn J. Lichtenberg, Esq.,

klichte@entergy.com

(504) 576-2763 - office

Tim Cragin, tcragin@entergy.com

(504) 576-6523 - office

Courtney Nicholson,

cnicho2@entergy.com

Larry Hand, lhand@entergy.com

Ed Wicker, ewicker@entergy.com

Entergy Services, Inc.

Mail Unit L-ENT-26E

639 Loyola Avenue

New Orleans, LA 70113

(504) 576-5579 - fax

#### Suzanne Fontan,

sfontan@entergy.com

(504-576-7497)

Terri Heckathorn,

gheckat@entergy.com

(504-576-6038)

Entergy Services, Inc.

Mail Unit L-ENT-4C

639 Loyola Avenue

New Orleans, LA 70113

Fax: (504)576-6029

#### Joe Romano, III,

jroman1@entergy.com Entergy Services, Inc. Mail Unit L-ENT-4C 639 Loyola Avenue

New Orleans, LA 70113 (504)576-4764 - office (504)576-2330 - fax

#### Kimberly Fontan,

kfontan@entergy.com

Vice President, Regulatory Affairs Entergy Louisiana, LLC Mail Unit L-JEF-357 4809 Jefferson Highway Jefferson, LA 70121 (504) 576-4179 - office

(504) 840-2681 - fax

### JACOBS TECHNOLOGY, INC.

### Mr. Michael L. Winberry

**Business Manager** Jacobs Technology Inc.

13800 Old Gentilly Road, Building

320

New Orleans, LA 70129

e-mail address:

michael.l.winberry@nasa.gov

### THE FOLGER COFFEE COMPANY (J.M. SMUCKER)

Mr. Randy Day

Director

The Folger Coffee Company 14601 Old Gentilly Road New Orleans, La 70129 e-mail address:

randy.day@jmsmucker.com

#### **USG CORPORATION**

#### Ernest L. Edwards, Jr.

Beirne, Maynard & Parsons, L.L.P. 601 Poydras Street
Suite 2200
New Orleans, LA 70130
(504) 584-9126 - office
(504 584-9142 - fax
e-mail address:
ledwards@bmpllp.com

### Mr. Fred M. Mazurski, CEM,

#### **CDSM**

Senior Manager, Energy USG Corporation

550 West Adams Street Chicago, IL 60661-3676

e-mail address: fmazurski@usg.com

#### SIERRA CLUB

#### Joshua Smith,

joshua.smith@sierraclub.org Staff Attorney Sierra Club Environmental Law Program 85 Second Street, 2nd Floor San Francisco, CA 94105 (415)977-5560 (415)977-5793 (fax) (503)484-7194 (cell)

# ALLIANCE FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY

#### Casey DeMoss, CEO,

casey@all4energy.org 4035 Washington Ave., New Orleans, LA 70125 (504)208-9761

### GULF STATES RENEWABLE ENERGY INDUSTRIES ASSOCIATION (GSREIA)

#### Jeff Cantin, President,

jcantin@gsreia.org 643 Magazine St., Ste. 102 New Orleans, LA 70130 (504) 383-8936

# Heather Pohnan, Administrative Director, hpohnan@gsreia.org

643 Magazine St., Ste. 102 New Orleans, LA 70130 Office: 888-647-7342 Mobile: 630-639-0631

#### **GREEN COAST ENTERPRISES**

#### Jacquelyn Dadakis,

jackie@greencoastenterprises.com Managing Director, GCE Services 2725 So. Broad Street New Orleans, LA 70125 504-459-4006

#### Alexandra Snedeker,

alex@greencoastenterprises.com Data Analyst, GCE Services 2725 So. Broad Street New Orleans, LA 70125 504-459-4007

# SOUTHEAST ENERGY EFFICIENCY ALLIANCE

#### Abby Fox,

### afox@seealliance.org

Policy Manager 50 Hurt Plaza SE, Suite 1250 Atlanta, GA 30303 Office: 404-602-9665 Cell: 901-292-3544

#### POSIGEN SOLAR SOLUTIONS

Karla Loeb, <u>kloeb@posigen.com</u> Director of Business Development 2424 Edenborn Ave., Suite 550 Metairie, LA 70001 504-293-5665

### Margot Want,

#### mwant@posigen.com

Associate General Counsel 2424 Edenborn Ave., Suite 550 Metairie, LA 70001 504-293-5670

# BUILDING SCIENCE INNOVATORS LLC

#### Myron Katz,

myron.bernard.katz@gmail.com 302 Walnut Street New Orleans, LA 70118

#### SOUTH COAST SOLAR, LLC

#### Robert L. Suggs, Jr., CEO,

rsuggs@southcoastsolar.com 2605 Ridgelake Drive Metairie, LA 70002 504-529-7869

# C. Tucker Crawford, Co-Founder / Partner,

tucker@southcoastsolar.com 2605 Ridgelake Drive Metairie, LA 70002 504-529-7869) 504-390-7000 (mobile)

# AIR PRODUCTS AND CHEMICALS, INC.

#### Ernest L. Edwards, Jr.

Beirne, Maynard & Parsons, L.L.P. 601 Poydras Street Suite 2200 New Orleans, LA 70130-6097 (504) 584-9126 – office (504) 450-4226 - cell (504 584-9142 - fax e-mail address: ledwards@bmpllp.com

#### Mark Zimmerman

Air Products and Chemicals, Inc. 7201 Hamilton Boulevard Allentown, PA 18195-1501 (610) 481-1288 - office (610) 481-2182 - fax